Revival of the Pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela: The Politics of Religious, National, and European Patrimony, 1879–1988*

Sasha D. Pack
State University of New York at Buffalo

> Spain is imperial and Catholic enough so that [St. James of] Compostela can be considered a purely national pilgrimage. . . . But how much better it is when St. James becomes ecumenical![1]

The martyrdom of St. James the Greater took place in Jerusalem in AD 44, yet in 1879 the Archbishop of Santiago de Compostela, a town of 25,000 inhabitants in Spanish Galicia, announced that the apostle's bones had been discovered buried beneath the local cathedral. Cardinal Miguel Payá's assertion appeared to confirm a millennial belief that St. James had evangelized the Iberian Peninsula, and his remains miraculously returned there after his death. Although its origins are murky, this tale acquired momentum in the ninth century, buttressed by a number of miracles and apparitions putatively demonstrating its veracity. Since that time, St. James has been the protagonist of three discrete but related myths identified in a masterful study by Francisco Márquez Villanueva: (1) the eschatological myth, centered on the archetypal missionary's travels and supposed entombment in Iberia, which gave rise to one of the most important pilgrimages of medieval Europe, known as the "Camino de Santiago"; (2) the military myth, according to which St. James appeared in northern Iberia in the ninth century to lead Christians in a war of *reconquista* against Islamic Spain; and (3) the state or protonationalist myth, which arose during the sixteenth century as the pilgrimage and *reconquista* waned, holding that St. James was the Spanish crown's patron and protector.[2]

* I wish to thank the Program for Cultural Cooperation between Spain's Ministry of Culture and United States Universities and the Baldy Center for Law and Social Policy for their generous support of this research. Additional thanks are owed to William J. Callahan for his willingness to share with me his many insights on contemporary Spanish Catholicism and to Erik Seeman, Colleen Culleton, and the journal's two anonymous reviewers for their thoughtful comments and suggestions.

[1] Maurice Legendre, director of the Casa de Velázquez, the official French cultural center in Madrid, in *Ecclesia*, July 24, 1943.

[2] Francisco Márquez Villanueva, *Santiago: Trayectoria de un mito* (Barcelona,

The Journal of Modern History 82 (June 2010): 335–367
© 2010 by The University of Chicago. 0022-2801/2010/8202-0003$10.00
All rights reserved.

The status of St. James, like that of the Spanish church in general, declined in the eighteenth century as pilgrimage and patron sainthood were increasingly dismissed as superstition. Liberal governments of the nineteenth century suspended the royal offering to St. James and weakened the independent church wealth upon which the hospitality system along the pilgrimage route depended. Although the cult never disappeared completely, its power as both a universal and a national symbol receded. Active devotion to it became almost totally limited to Galicia and nearby districts of northern Portugal. Very few pilgrims completed the "French road" across northern Iberia, and those who did were often struck by the extent to which this medieval jewel had become pauperized.[3]

Cardinal Payá's announcement of 1879 set in motion a protracted revival of the Jacobean cult in Spain and throughout the Catholic world over the course of the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Its immediate effect was to breathe new life into the cult of the relic. St. James Day (July 25) festivities grew, and collective pilgrimages became a sizable public event, first regionally, then nationally and internationally, acquiring enduring political significance. The Jacobean movement differed fundamentally from other Catholic cults of the period that scholars have interpreted as popular responses to the dislocations of urban industrial society.[4] Unlike any number of Marian apparitions in Europe since the Reformation, the miracles of St. James were not living phenomena but rather had issued from an ancient religious tradition, apparently with little relevance in modern times. The discovery and identification of his bones did not

---

2004). On the latter myth, also see Katherine Elliot van Liere, "The Moorslayer and the Missionary: James the Apostle in Spanish Historiography from Isidore of Seville to Ambrosio de Morales," *Viator* 37 (2006): 519–43. Américo Castro (*Santiago de España* [Buenos Aires, 1958]), the greatest student of the Jacobean myth in Spain, posited that Galicians confused two early Christian martyrs, James the Greater and James the Lesser, and sometime during the low Middle Ages grafted this conflation onto a pre-Roman sacred site.

[3] For a grand historical synthesis of the Catholic Church in modern Spain, see William J. Callahan, *Church, Politics, and Society in Spain, 1750–1874* (Cambridge, MA, 1984), and *The Catholic Church in Spain, 1875–1998* (Washington, DC, 2000). On the regional cult of St. James, see Antón Pombo Rodríguez, "Iria y Padrón en el resurgir decimonónico del culto y la peregrinación a Santiago (1875–1900)," in *Padrón, Iria, y las tradiciones jacobeas*, ed. Vicente Almazán (Santiago de Compostela, 2004), 73–99, 74–75; and Márquez Villanueva, *Santiago*, 294.

[4] See William A. Christian, Jr., *Moving Crucifixes in Modern Spain* (Princeton, NJ, 1992); Ruth Harris, *Lourdes: Body and Spirit in the Secular Age* (New York, 1999); David Blackbourn, *Marpingen: Apparitions of the Virgin Mary in Nineteenth-Century Germany* (New York, 1994); and Robert Levine, *Vale of Tears: Revisiting the Canudos Massacre in Northeastern Brazil* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1992).

suggest divine intervention, but, on the contrary, resembled a modern archaeological excavation and was supported with scientific analysis. Later, studious fidelity to the medieval pilgrimage route, stretching some 800 kilometers from the Pyrenees to Galicia, became a form of communion not only with St. James but with the pilgrims' millennial forebears as well. If one red thread runs throughout the multifaceted story of the Jacobean revival, it is its participants' search for an authentic past that might sharpen their understandings of Catholicism, Spain, and ultimately Europe.

The three millennial Jacobean myths resurfaced and adapted to the modern political order. Spectacles evoking the *reconquista* were often rallying points for Catholic protest during a time when the label "Catholic" increasingly identified an activist minority. Political Catholicism reached its apogee in the 1930s and 1940s, when an insurgent nationalist army led by Francisco Franco formally restored the symbolic association between St. James and the institutions of state. When skeptical scholars punched holes in the defense of the relic's authenticity, partisans of the cult defiantly rebutted that positive science alone was insufficient to establish truth. As this politics of "National Catholicism" declined and an ethos of cooperation came to prevail in postwar Europe, a cadre of Spanish clerics, bureaucrats, and diplomats began to recast the pilgrimage as an emblem of exchange, ecumenism, and the universal virtues of travel. In 1988, two years after Spain's admission to the European Community, the Council of Europe designated the Camino de Santiago to be the "First European Cultural Itinerary." In 2004, the Spanish crown's main cultural foundation praised the pilgrimage for its role as a "generator of extraordinary spiritual, social, cultural economic vitality" and called it "a symbol of brotherhood among peoples and a true axis for the first common European consciousness."[5]

A range of cultural, religious, and political messages thus accumulated around the relic and pilgrimage over the course of the long century following Payá's announcement. These inspired several different types of pilgrimages, which pilgrims carried out with varying deference to formal liturgy, historical patrimony, and penance through physical suffering. The label "pilgrim" could be applied to a Galician parishioner reaching Santiago by chartered rail in 1885, just as it could to a nationalist infantryman marching into town with his unit for the St. James Day offering in 1938 and to a Parisian tourist retracing the medieval route on bicycle in 1965. A different type of study would be required to create a formal typology of pilgrims or to assess their mentalities. The present study examines those who spoke to and for pilgrims and how they adapted the triad of Jacobean myths to changing political contexts.

[5] Fundación Príncipe de Asturias, http://www.fpa.es/esp/premios/galardones/galardonados/trayectorias/trayectoria795.html.

This history reveals three parallel shifts in emphasis over this period: from the authenticity of the relic to that of the route, from moral reconquest to evangelical mission, and from nationalism to internationalism. In each case, the sword-wielding or National Catholic St. James ceded ground to the peaceable wandering apostle, the latter being more appropriate for the millions of postwar tourists and pilgrims seeking some form of spiritual or intellectual nourishment along the Jacobean route. These parallel transformations suggest pathways of continuity from the National Catholic politics prevalent in Spain (and throughout much of Europe in the period between the fall of Papal Rome and the Second World War) to an emerging political-cultural narrative of European unity based on a shared past and a commitment to universal humanistic principles.

It might seem counterintuitive that a widely praised emblem of Europe's common heritage should be the legacy of a movement founded on Catholic orthodoxy and hypernationalism. Yet it must be remembered that the commonplace opposition of nationalism versus Europeanism is the product of a particular historical moment in which postwar leaders found it advantageous to ignore the deep interconnections between the two concepts.[6] As with other European nations, many aspects of contemporary Spanish history can be interpreted as a struggle to reconcile the nation with some ideal "Europe." Historians similarly have dismantled a false opposition between nationalism and religion, an abstraction that emerged largely out of political struggles between church and state during the nineteenth century.[7] Like many other modern myths, that of St. James of Compostela was simultaneously rooted in religious and ethnonational histories, and it was therefore well suited, mutatis mutandis, for assimilation into a story of common European heritage. The revival of the Jacobean cult and pilgrimage was from the start an enterprise directed by a church hierarchy anxious to assert the place of Catholicism in Galician regional and Spanish national politics. While the belligerent National Catholic "moral reconquest" lost momentum in the 1950s, the concept of shared religious and national (and later European) patrimony remained relevant. Positioned at this overlap, Santiago de Compostela and its pilgrimage evolved into a symbolic anchor for a conservative authoritarian regime struggling to adjust to a changing international order and finally into an abstract symbol of universal humanist ideals of which the church, the region, and the Europeanist nation-state alike could claim ownership.

[6] See, e.g., Ute Frevert, "Europeanizing Germany's Twentieth Century," *History and Memory* 17 (2005): 87–116.

[7] Michael Burleigh, *Earthly Powers: The Clash of Religion and Politics in Europe, from the French Revolution to the Great War* (New York, 2005); David A. Bell, *The Cult of the Nation in Modern France: Inventing Nationalism, 1680–1800* (Cambridge, MA, 2001).

I. Religion and Nation: Some Context

Before proceeding with the account of the relic's discovery and the revival of its cult, it will first be useful to consider the relationship between nation and religion in modern Catholic Europe and particularly Spain. One attribute shared by partisans of each was an obsession with authenticity, origins, and historical patrimony, all of which became increasingly necessary components for establishing the legitimacy of their cause.[8] New forms of rigorous engagement with the past, such as archaeology, historic preservation movements, heritage tourism, and professional historiography, were often not far from present concerns. Anxiety over the fate of cultural patrimony in the face of progress and "revolutionary historicide" became widespread in the nineteenth century, while the revolutionaries themselves seized religious and aristocratic possessions in the name of the national patrimony.[9] By the early twentieth century, as tourism became more commercial, a destination's purported authenticity—the extent to which it had remained unspoiled by the pretensions of modern civilization—became a key competitive advantage.[10] Modern European historiography was itself largely motivated by the search for the origins of nations in their preurban and, in a purportedly rational age, religious pasts. Christopher Schmidt-Nowara has shown the Hispanic world to be quite vigorous in this regard by the mid-nineteenth century, when historians' debates over the nature of early modern imperial conquests became proxies for a deeper struggle between pan-Hispanism and emerging colonial nationalisms.[11] All of these indicate a tightening relationship between science and history, on the one hand, and between history and identity, on the other.

[8] On this point, see David Lowenthal, *Possessed by the Past: The Heritage Crusade and the Spoils of History* (New York, 1996).

[9] Rudy Koshar, *Germany's Transient Pasts* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1998), 30–34; Lowenthal, *Possessed by the Past*, 63–64; María Dolores García Gómez, "Incautaciones: Aportaciones documentales para un informe del patrimonio eclesiástico en el siglo XIX," *Hispania Sacra* 57 (2005): 265–314.

[10] Two historical studies of this phenomenon in France are Patrick Young, "Of Pardons, Loss, and Longing: The Tourist's Pursuit of Originality in Brittany, 1890–1935," *French Historical Studies* 30 (2007): 269–304; and Stephen L. Harp, *Marketing Michelin: Advertising and Cultural Identity in Twentieth-Century France* (Baltimore, 2001). For a classic theoretical treatment, see Dean MacCannell, *The Tourist: A New Theory of the Leisure Class* (1976; repr., Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1999), esp. 91–107.

[11] Christopher Schmidt-Nowara, *The Conquest of History: Spanish Colonialism and National Histories in the Nineteenth Century* (Pittsburgh, 2006). The principal English-language study of national history writing in Spain is Carolyn P. Boyd, *Historia Patria: Politics, History, and National Identity in Spain, 1875–1975* (Princeton, NJ, 1997). For a general discussion, see Jonathan Dewald, *Lost Worlds: The Emergence of French Social History, 1815–1970* (University Park, PA, 2006).

Though historians of modern Europe have dealt with these concepts most thoroughly with reference to nationalism, Catholicism displayed a similar pattern. Many Catholic clerics perceived a near existential competition with nationalist movements, and yet it is possible to observe considerable formal resemblance and exchange between the two rivals.[12] Locked in a battle with the Italian Risorgimento over ownership of Roman universalism, Pope Pius IX (1846–78) borrowed several nationalist devices for inculcating a sense of popular belonging. For example, the pontiff was an eager patron of Giovanni Battista de Rossi, the pioneer of Christian archaeology. He sponsored Rossi's exploration of early Christian relics buried underneath the modern city in hopes of becoming the "second Damasus," in reference to the fourth-century pope known for linking Christianity to Rome's imperial glory.[13]

Blanket church hostility toward all nationalism could not endure, however, and a new generation of clergy would come to recognize and exploit the idea, in the words of Michael Burleigh, "that nations were as essential to the divine plan as the family or the monarchy."[14] A large scholarly literature has documented the Catholic nationalist political mobilization, particularly in France after 1871, around group pilgrimages to Rome, the Holy Land, and regional shrines of saints.[15] Church possessions transformed into a kind of collectively owned patrimony with simultaneously historical and religious significance. Traffic in Christian relics rose steadily over the course of the nineteenth century as dioceses sought to retrieve sacred objects that had been displaced amid revolutionary turmoil. As Yves Gagneux has argued in a remarkably well researched monograph on relics in nineteenth-century Paris, the project of restoring religious artifacts to their home dioceses engendered a new public awareness of sacred objects and their ties to particular locales. A relic's authenticity was typically established with archaeological evidence, chemical analysis, testimonies, and historical documentation, a process that often be-

[12] For a discussion of scholarly literature on this question, see Anthony D. Smith, *Chosen Peoples: Sacred Sources of National Identity* (New York, 2003), 9–18.

[13] Antonio Baruffa, *Giovanni Battista de Rossi: L'archeologo esploratore delle Catacombe* (Vatican City, 1994), esp. 77–80. For a summary of Pius IX's populism, see Sheridan Gilley, "The Papacy," in *World Christianities, c. 1815–c. 1914*, vol. 8 of *The Cambridge History of Christianity* (Cambridge, 2006), 17–19. On the idea of universalism in the Roman question, see Federico Chabod, *Italian Foreign Policy: The Statecraft of the Founders*, trans. William McCuaig (Princeton, NJ, 1996), 145–234.

[14] Burleigh, *Earthly Powers*, 157.

[15] See Elizabeth Emery and Laura Morowitz, *Consuming the Past: The Medieval Revival in Fin-de-siècle France* (Burlington, VT, 2003); Thomas Kselman, *Miracles and Prophecies in Nineteenth-Century France* (New Brunswick, NJ, 1983), esp. 113–21.

came the subject of great interest among parishioners and savants.[16] Every medieval relic contained ethnic as well as spiritual meaning, uniting a local territorial community with the universal church. As relics were restored to local parishes, often housed in exaggerated replicas of the original shrines, they reminded viewers of the depth of the church's historical roots in the town.[17] Across the Atlantic, Schmidt-Nowara recounts a remarkable episode in 1877 in which a Vatican representative announced the discovery of Columbus's remains in Santo Domingo, contradicting the standard belief that the explorer was buried in Havana. The authenticity of the Columbian relic became a cause célèbre of the local Dominican clergy, who hoped to turn the Genoese mariner into a patron saint of the former Spanish colony. Spanish nationalists, who claimed Columbus for their own pantheon of heroes, marshaled heaps of historical and forensic evidence to discredit the finding. Although never definitively resolved, the affair indicated the Vatican's willingness to participate in the marketplace of nationalist movements, and, in this case, to deploy its now infallible word to this end in a matter of scientific authenticity.[18]

Spain's national and religious pasts similarly gained attention from political figures, clergy, local boosters, the government, and the Vatican. Historians have interpreted most such activity in terms of the politics of memory, each commemoration becoming a theater to stage one or several of Spain's competing national narratives. The country experienced a bout of what Javier Moreno Luzón terms "commemorationitis" in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, with Catholics frequently in the vanguard.[19] Many such events were unambiguous examples of an emotive, presentist type of collective memory in which the question of positive scientific authenticity was unimportant.[20] Such exercises were conceived to lend prestige to dioceses often locked in competition with one another for scarce funds, and they were supported by provincial elites aiming to assert their region's constitutive role in the broader national community.[21] For example, directors of a campaign

[16] Yves Gagneux, *Reliques et reliquaires à Paris (XIXe–XXe siècle)* (Paris, 2007), 27–42.

[17] Ibid., 201.

[18] Schmidt-Nowara, *Conquest of History*, 53–95.

[19] Javier Moreno-Luzón, "Fighting for the National Memory: The Commemoration of the Spanish 'War of Independence' in 1908–1912," *History and Memory* 19 (2007): 68–94, 69.

[20] On the distinction and interconnection between memory and history, see Pierre Nora, "Between Memory and History: *Les Lieux de Mémoire*," *Representations* 26 (1989): 7–25.

[21] On this point, see Xosé-Manoel Núñez Seixas, "The Region as Essence of the Fatherland: Regionalist Variants of Spanish Nationalism (1840–1936)," *European History Quarterly* 31 (2001): 483–518.

begun in 1872 to rebuild the shrine at Covadonga, in the northern province of Asturias, depicted the local skirmish that took place there in circa 718 as the start of an 800-year protonational crusade against Islamic rule. As Carolyn Boyd has observed, the archbishop who led the effort enjoyed considerable support from Asturian regionalists and ignored a handful of local skeptics who considered the National Catholic Covadonga narrative to be historically unfounded.[22]

Leaders of the deeply traditionalist Carlist party militia showed particular initiative in fusing nationalism with religious commemoration. After the Spanish army crushed their violent uprising in 1876, they refocused their efforts on organizing mass gatherings associated with significant days and places. They chose such contrived sites of memory as the millennium of the apparition of the Virgin of Montserrat (1880), the thirteenth centennial of Reccared I's conversion to Christianity (1889), and the tricentennial of the death of St. Theresa of Avila (1882), and they paraded Spanish pilgrims through Rome on the feast day of St. Theresa as well. Indeed, to the chagrin of some moderate clergy, Carlist leaders were the chief organizers of Spain's national pilgrimage to Rome between 1876 and 1882.[23] The political aspect of this type of religious tourism was unsubtle, and the success of a pilgrimage depended on mass participation much as any socialist rally would have.[24] The Carlists boasted a network of influential newspapers and garnered the sympathy of much of the church hierarchy, especially in the north and east of the peninsula, where pilgrimage activity was most heavily promoted. Their largely rural constituency, traveling by rail often at a reduced fare, arrived at the shrines by the thousands. This concentration of a normally dispersed population produced a considerable visual effect, as participants from isolated districts bore witness to the sheer numbers of others who shared their values, anxieties, and grievances. In the words of a major integrist publicist, "Our

[22] Carolyn P. Boyd, "The Second Battle of Covadonga: The Politics of Commemoration in Modern Spain," *History and Memory* 14 (2002): 37–64.

[23] Antón Pombo Rodríguez, "Peregrinaciones españolas a Roma en los albores de la restauración (1876–1882): Entre la devoción ultramontana y la política carlista," in *Atti del Convegno Internazionale di Studi "Santiago e l'Italia," Perugia, 23–26 maggio 2002*, ed. Paolo Caucci von Saucken (Perugia, 2005), 575–645, 586–88; Giuliana Di Febo, "El modelo beligerante del nacionalcatolicismo franquista: La influencia del carlismo," in *Religión y política en la España contemporánea*, ed. Carolyn P. Boyd (Madrid, 2007), 57–79, 74–75; Boyd, *Historia Patria*, 99–121.

[24] In addition to Di Febo and Pombo Rodríguez, see Cristobal Robles Muñoz, "Política y clero en la Restauración: La crisis de 1881–1883," *Hispania Sacra* 38 (1986): 355–98. On the political aspects of mass commercial tourism in mid-twentieth-century Spain, see Sasha D. Pack, *Tourism and Dictatorship: Europe's Peaceful Invasion of Franco's Spain* (New York, 2006).

pilgrimages . . . give an idea of the magnificent number of those who always remain in reserve under the banner of the mass Catholic army."[25]

The crude politics of mass pilgrimage might have suited a church enjoined by its Pope in the *Syllabus of Errors* (1864) to treat liberalism as nothing short of sin. But the preeminent role of a party militia in organizing the events defied a later papal order, *Non Expedit* (1874), for Catholics to disengage from secular politics. The central role of Cándido Nocedal, a prominent Carlist newspaperman, became the object of particular controversy. Nocedal was the chief organizer and publicist of most public pilgrimages in Spain, a fact that did not sit well with moderate Catholics uncomfortable with the primacy of a lay political activist in such events. Nocedal used his newspapers as a forum to tar his rivals—namely, the nonpartisan clerical organization Catholic Union—as accommodationist toward the liberal state. Although many Spanish clergy would continue to admire him, Nocedal's brazenness provoked the Vatican to intervene in 1882 to break Carlist control of the Rome pilgrimage.[26]

It is conceivable that, left to the Carlists, Santiago de Compostela might have reemerged as another site of mass pilgrimage and integrist protest. But instead it was the local archdiocesan hierarchy that seized the initiative in 1878. Rather than contrive another act of commemoration, it set out to find and positively identify the relic. The revival of the Jacobean relic illustrated the extent to which the church hierarchy now was willing to exploit its power to authenticate historical patrimony in order to strengthen the position of a regional diocese. Nearly a century later, the Franco government would similarly marshal the Jacobean patrimony to orient Spanish nationalism toward Europe. This focus on authenticity—of the relic, and, later, of the pilgrimage route—conjured an enduring engagement between religion, nation, and Europe, and a much deeper connection between place, history, and faith.

II. Discovery and Authentication

The excavations that would allegedly unearth St. James's remains were the initiative of two men: the new Archbishop Cardinal Payá and his cathedral canon, Antonio López Ferreiro. Payá had been selected in 1873, amid revolutionary turmoil, to replace the deceased Miguel García Cuesta. García Cuesta had made himself an enemy of Spanish liberals for his refusal to denounce Carlism, a political minefield that Payá had judiciously managed to circumnavigate. Payá had spoken eloquently at the First Vatican Council in favor of the doctrine of papal infallibility, and though he had taken a principled stand in support of bishops who had resisted government pressure to

[25] *Revista Popular* 493 (May 20, 1880), quoted in Pombo Rodríguez, "Peregrinaciones españolas," 588.

[26] Pombo Rodríguez, "Peregrinaciones españolas," 591.

denounce Carlism, he would never endorse the movement himself.[27] Payá would become active in the Rome pilgrimages, although he later joined the critics of Carlist efforts to politicize these events.[28] He assumed his new post as Archbishop of Santiago de Compostela in February 1875, arriving in the town via the recently completed railway. He was greeted there by Antonio López Ferreiro, a native Galician who, after completing advanced theological training, had attained a post in the cathedral in 1871. A tenacious student of both Galician and Church history, López Ferreiro would dedicate his career to cataloging the massive cathedral archives.

Payá's arrival coincided with an upswing in local interest in the Jacobean feast and pilgrimage. In 1875, two local physicians made the pilgrimage from Santiago de Compostela to Rome and on to Jerusalem, subsequently publishing a massive travelogue of this grand triumvirate of medieval pilgrimages.[29] The Feast of St. James was, moreover, becoming increasingly an occasion for local commerce and revelry.[30] By the mid-nineteenth century, town authorities had arranged for fireworks and the illumination of buildings to mark the occasion. In 1872, they added a coordinated ringing of church bells across the diocese, in order, in the words of a mayor's aide, to "render solemn with the greatest possible ostentation the . . . celebration of St. James the Apostle."[31] In 1877, the regional railway company began to promote the fair, and the local Sociedad Económica de los Amigos del País, a club of prominent local figures, became involved in organizing the event, which now got under way several days in advance of the precise feast day of July 25.[32]

The immediate inspiration for Payá's decision to search for the relic appears to have come while attending the election of Leo XIII in Rome in February 1878. On returning home, Payá announced a plan to "proceed with a general cleaning of the vault, walls, and floors" of the cathedral.[33] He designated

[27] Francisco Martí Gilabert, *La cuestión religiosa en la Revolución de 1868–1874* (Madrid, 1989), 109–14; Juan José Cebrián Franco, *Obispos de Iria y arzobispos de Santiago de Compostela* (Santiago de Compostela, 1997), 289, 294; Pombo Rodríguez, "Iria y Padrón," 73.

[28] The full text of Payá's critique can be found in his correspondence with papal nuncio Angelo Bianchi, January 25, 1882, reprinted in Pombo Rodríguez, "Peregrinaciones españolas," 634–35.

[29] José María Fernández Sánchez and Francisco Freire Barreiro, *Santiago, Jerusalén, Roma: Diario de una peregrinación á estos y otros santos lugares de España, Francia, Egipto, Palestina, Siria é Italia en el año de Jubileo universal de 1875*, 3 vols. (Santiago de Compostela, 1880–82).

[30] Ibid., 1: 36–37.

[31] Ayuntamiento de Santiago de Compostela to Arzobispado, July 22, 1872, Archivo Histórico Diocesano de Santiago de Compostela (hereafter AHDSC), FG/1.33/490.

[32] Actas del Cabildo, 1876–1882, Archivo de la Catedral de Santiago de Compostela (hereafter ACSC), IG 634.

[33] Cebrián Franco, *Obispos de Iria*, 294.

López Ferreiro to lead the project. Although the cathedral council approved the plan, it did not discuss any procedures beyond a general cleaning. Rumors soon began to circulate about town that something more elaborate was afoot, possibly an archaeological excavation. Most of the work was carried out under cover of night with only López Ferreiro and his close associates present. By August, the team was unable to conceal the extent of its work, provoking concern among members of the cathedral chapter. One group accused the archbishop of ignoring church bylaws requiring the presence of an accredited architect to supervise any alteration to the building's structure. The archbishop deflected this charge for months before eventually conceding that a search for the holy crypt was indeed under way and asking the council members for their support.[34]

On the night of January 29, 1879, López Ferreiro and his team reported finding over three hundred bone fragments buried behind the cathedral's main altar. The following day, news of the discovery was announced to the cathedral council and, "with the aim of giving this event the greatest possible publicity and solemnity," several local political, university, and business leaders were invited to view the bones on the afternoon of February 1.[35] A pharmacist and a Carlist physician from the University of Santiago de Compostela were then enlisted to evaluate the remains, cataloguing them and analyzing their chemical composition. The pair determined that the bones came from three distinct skeletons, one of which appeared to be of Celtic origin, and all of which "surely had been in existence for many centuries." According to their carefully worded conclusion, "In view of [the bones'] age, it does not seem imprudent to believe that they had belonged to the bodies of St. James the Apostle and his two disciples."[36] Payá delivered the public announcement on February 6, along with an admission that the intent all along had been "to undertake a subterranean reconnaissance to see if we could find any residue of the original sepulcher in which the Apostle was buried . . . and any relics."[37]

At this point, the findings were merely bones; their transformation into a relic would take five years. The authentication procedure followed standard

[34] ACSC, Fondo Guerra Campos, Leg. 390.

[35] Actas del Cabildo, January 31–February 1, 1879, ACSC, IG 634.

[36] The complete testimony is contained in a letter dated July 20, 1879, signed by Antonio Casares, Francisco Freire, and Timoteo Sánchez Freire. Copies of this letter are housed in the Vatican Secret Archive (hereafter VSA), "Expendiente sobre autenticidad Reliquias Santiago, 1879–1884", Congr. SS. Rituum Processus, 4165, and in the ACSC, Fondo Guerra Campos, Leg. 390. The letter was published in Fidel Fita and Aurelio Fernández-Guerra, *Recuerdo de un viaje á Santiago de Galicia* (Madrid, 1880), 109–11, and more recently in Márquez Villanueva, *Santiago*, 438–43.

[37] Quoted in *Boletín Oficial de Arzobispo de Santiago de Compostela* (*BOAS*) 666 (February 6, 1979): 49–54; Cebrián Franco, *Obispos de Iria*, 294.

Vatican practice. López Ferreiro assembled a range of supporting evidence for the dossier, which was to be evaluated first by an archdiocesan ombudsman and later by a council of scientists in Rome. He included the physicians' statement along with seven extended interviews of town elders who recalled their ancestors venerating certain unmarked walls in the cathedral. To supplement the medical and folkloric evidence, he added notes from the historical record. From the cathedral archives, he gathered documents from 1589 discussing the crypt's transfer to a secret location at a time when a landing in Galicia by Francis Drake was feared imminent.[38] Later that year, Spain's leading classical linguist, the Jesuit bishop Fidel Fita, traveled from Madrid in order to study the findings further. A recently inducted member of the Real Academia de Historia, and later the successor to Marcelino Menéndez y Pelayo as its president, Fita lent his prestigious name to the case, publishing a log of his journey to Santiago de Compostela and a treatise on the relic's legitimacy.[39] The complete dossier was sent off to Rome in July. Vatican archaeologists evaluated the evidence supporting the relic's authenticity; they also received a dissension submitted by the skeptical members of the chapter who had charged that the excavation and evaluation processes were opaque. In 1884, Leo XIII declared the remains authentic in his bull *Deus Omnipotens*. Those who had signed on to the dissent were suspended *a divinis* (prohibited from performing their priestly functions).

III. Two Authenticities, Relic and Pilgrimage

Authentication was a notoriously difficult exercise, and the antiquity of the St. James case left it particularly open to doubt. Even in cases involving newer relics, scholarly dissent often continued for decades and many disputes were never definitively resolved. As Yves Gagneux has argued, academic debates over authenticity tended to occur on a separate plane from the popular cults of relics, which could quickly blossom following a local clergyman's initial pronouncement.[40] The St. James episode conformed to this pattern, producing a credulous revival in the popular cult followed by a protracted debate among historians and theologians. The first process contributed to a rising tide of National Catholic demonstrations in the region: in his role as Moorslayer, St. James had inspired the *reconquista* of the Iberian Peninsula from Islam, and so too would he guide modern Christians to conquer the forces of liberalism and skepticism. The second process worked more slowly, but its impact was more enduring. Intellectuals, antiquarians, and eventually tourists would turn

[38] "Expediente sobre autenticidad Reliquias Santiago, 1879–1884", VSA, Congr. SS. Rituum Processus, 4165.

[39] Fita and Fernández-Guerra, *Recuerdo de un viaje*, passim.

[40] Gagneux, *Reliques et reliquaires*, 192.

to the historic pilgrimage, where St. James offered spiritual guidance in his role as pilgrim and apostle. More than the *reconquista* myth, the pilgrimage suited the Catholic Church of the latter half of the twentieth century as it gradually relinquished claims to hegemony and turned to a more evangelical mission.

The Relic: Reconquista Authenticity, 1885–1948

The papal affirmation of 1884 was scarcely necessary to draw out legions of the devoted in districts in and around Galicia. Payá's initial announcement of February 1879 quickly received press in Galicia and northern Portugal. Fita published his defense of the findings in 1880 and, after 1882, spent his summers in Galicia greeting pilgrims and giving public lectures on related topics.[41] In addition to declaring the relic's authenticity, Leo XIII's *Deus Omnipotens* also designated 1885 to be an extraordinary Jacobean Holy Year even though the normal criterion requiring that St. James Day fall on a Sunday was not met. The precise significance of this concession was to grant special indulgences to those receiving communion in the cathedral, but the greater purpose was to attract wider public attention to the matter. (The only other pontiff to invoke this prerogative was Pius XI in 1938, the year that, amid civil war, Francisco Franco restored the royal offering to St. James.) Payá soon gained a reputation as the "second Gelmírez," in reference to the twelfth-century archbishop who had built Compostela's original grandeur. Between 1879 and his departure for Toledo in 1886, he restored public access to the shrine, enhanced the role of St. James in the liturgical calendar, and personally received numerous public pilgrimages and individual "artistic pilgrims" (as cultural tourists were called).[42]

Santiago de Compostela thus began its transformation from a shrine for devout or penitential individuals into a major Catholic heritage site. In the prior period of 1815–84, the town had drawn between 100 and 500 pilgrims in a Holy Year, a few dozen in ordinary years, and somewhat fewer during periods of civil disorder.[43] The majority were individuals and families arriving from nearby districts in northern Spain and Portugal, though perhaps one-fifth came from beyond the Iberian Peninsula. Although there is no record of how they traveled, most probably accepted charity accommodations from religious

[41] Juan Manuel Abascal Palazón, *Fidel Fita: Su legado documental en la Real Academia de la Historia* (Madrid, 1999), 27.

[42] Antón Pombo Rodríguez, "Rexurdir do Culto Xacobeo e da peregrinación durante o pontificado do Cardeal Miguel Payá y Rico (1875–1886)," in *V Congreso Internacional de Asociacións Xacobeas: Actas 9–12 de Outubro de 1999* (A Coruña, 1998), 157–96.

[43] Carmen Pugliese, *El Camino de Santiago en el siglo XIX* (Santiago de Compostela, 2003), 25–27.

institutions en route and lodged at the Royal Hospital while in Santiago. For the period 1884–1905, the registry of pilgrims at the Royal Hospital indicated no rise in arrivals, yet the press began to report a "great influx" of pilgrims each year around July 25. Several hundred and possibly thousands arrived in large groups from nearby parishes but did not stay overnight at the Royal Hospital, where the official head count was taken. In 1897, the first Holy Year since 1886, nearly one thousand pilgrims registered at the Royal Hospital, a presence not seen since 1802, and even this figure can have represented only a fraction of the total crowd. The social composition of the pilgrims indicated an increasingly popular and collective event. There were more young pilgrims between ages 20 and 40 and a higher proportion of women—over one-half, compared to the overall total of roughly one-third for the entire nineteenth century. The month of July, the height of the festivities, accounted for the bulk of the increase.[44] That the St. James pilgrimage was becoming more of a family affair must have pleased clerics, who had begun to construe their liberal and socialist enemies as agents of a materialist, hypermasculine assault on the traditional family.[45] Even the changing data from the Royal Hospital registry only told part of the story. *El Eco de Santiago* reported that by July 24 three thousand pilgrims had already arrived, some of whom had traveled on foot a distance of 4–15 leagues (roughly 10–40 miles). Group pilgrimages continued to arrive into December, including at least one group as large as ten thousand, according to one source. Residents were instructed to decorate their windows and balconies to welcome the parades of arriving pilgrims (a mandate that the municipal guard was called upon to enforce), and the mayor promised special consideration to public order on days of major pilgrimage arrivals.[46]

The relic's transformative effect on the rhythm of local life would put Santiago de Compostela in league with an emerging set of touristic cities in Spain. Foremost among these was the cosmopolitan beach resort of San Sebastian, whose success inspired several towns and cities to modernize the municipal infrastructure and promote local festivals in order to draw in visitors.[47] At Santiago de Compostela, the chief concern was less to modernize the old town than to preserve it, though such efforts would gain momentum

[44] Ibid., 37; Arquivo Histórico Universitario de Santiago de Compostela (hereafter AHUSC), U/Enfermos/348.

[45] For an overview, see Immaculada Blasco Ibáñez, "Female Citizenship and Catholic Militancy in 1920s Spain," *Gender and History* 19 (2007): 445.

[46] AHDSC, FG/1.33/490.

[47] See Carmelo Pellejero Martínez, "El auge del turismo en Málaga durante el reinado de Alfonso XIII (1902–1931)," in *Il turismo e le città tra XVIII e XXI secolo: Italia e Spagna a confronto*, ed. Patrizia Battilani and Donatella Strangio (Milan, 2007), 67–100; John K. Walton, "Planning and Seaside Tourism: San Sebastián, 1863–1936," *Planning Perspectives* 17 (2002), 1–20.

only later (see below). Growth of the festival, however, continued to accelerate. Local clubs began to sponsor such events as sports contests, musical acts, and a Galician-language poetry contest. The display of fireworks in 1883 included "a profusion of lights of diverse colors and capricious pyrotechnical games" that would illuminate several local buildings, including "the great Mudejar-style monument to the triumph of Christianity over Islam."[48] Cardinal José Martín de Herrera, who assumed the post of archbishop in 1889, intensified efforts begun during Payá's tenure. He created an apostolic archconfraternity, to be led by López Ferreiro, for the purpose of organizing large pilgrimage processions into the old town. Unlike his predecessors, he participated directly in the festivities and explicitly connected St. James to contemporary nationalist causes, encouraging his countrymen to make the pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela in 1896 to support Spain's war effort in Cuba.[49] The archdiocese collaborated with trade organizations, and in 1897 the mayor prevailed on the Northern Railway to offer a 50 percent fare discount for pilgrims and to transport religious accessories free of charge.[50] Merchants and clerics alike enjoyed seeing the town come alive at the height of summer, as it had through a similar combination of commerce and religion in the Middle Ages. The 1897 Holy Year festival program would be stretched to fifteen days, a length that would be maintained in subsequent Holy Years and, after 1918, in ordinary years as well. The program committee retained an upmarket Barcelona lithographer to produce promotional materials that would be distributed across the peninsula, including to Portugal. In search of inspiration, organizers even wrote to the mayor of Zaragoza requesting copies of the program and wall poster used there to promote the festival of Our Lady of the Pillar. The number of nonreligious leisure activities during the festival period also grew. Galician-themed cultural events were a particular area of interest, along with a public lecture series on the regional economy, various charity fund drives, a soccer tournament, and, beginning in 1916, a bullfight series.[51]

The conflation of pilgrim and tourist was considered not a problematic mixture of sacred and profane but rather proof of a renewed dynamism at this historic seat of Spanish Catholicism. Numbers benefited business and aggrandized the archdiocese, though commerce and consumption did not yet register

[48] Quoted from 1883 program of the Festival of the Apostle, AHDSC, Caja 490, Exp. VIII.

[49] "Circular sobre peregrinación a Santiago en favor de la guerra de Cuba," *BOAS* 35 (January 16, 1896): 19–21; José Ramón Rodríguez Lago, "La Iglesia de la Archidiócesis compostelana en torno al 98," in *En torno al 98*, 2 vols., ed. Rafael Sánchez Mantero (Huelva, 2000), 1:79–92; Carlos García Cortés, "El Pontificado compostelano del Cardenal Martín de Herrera (1835–1922): Fuentes para su estudio ideológico y pastoral," *Compostellanum* 34 (1989): 508.

[50] AHDSC, FG/1.33/490.

[51] AHUSC, Fondo Municipal/1341, 1347, and 1348.

on the scale experienced at pilgrimage centers such as Lourdes.[52] The Royal Hospital registry was replaced with a more inclusive counting method that recorded everybody who took communion at the cathedral. The tally reached 140,000 in 1909 and was similar in the subsequent Holy Years of 1915, 1920, and 1926.[53] The first tourist guide to Santiago de Compostela, published in 1915, included a dedication praising the local tourism junta for its work combating "the wave of modernism advancing from the Pyrenees threatening to submerge the age-old character of our nationality . . . and the ridiculous desire to turn [Santiago] into a *ville moderne*."[54] Similar harangues against modernity filled the local Catholic press and sermons delivered to the pilgrims, though even in the moment it would not have been difficult to recognize in political Catholicism a highly modern convergence of tourism, patrimony, and mass spectacle.

Rapid growth in the pilgrimage underlined the influence of its indefatigable champion, Antonio López Ferreiro. As the quasi-official cathedral historian and now head of the archconfraternity of St. James, López Ferreiro would orient the pastoral and ideological message behind the event. Like Pius IX, pontiff during his formative years, López Ferreiro was outwardly intransigent toward ideas he considered modern, but he nonetheless understood how to deploy them selectively to further his ends. The authentication process itself had been an example of this: accepted principles of modern archaeology had at least notionally been applied, combining classical philological knowledge with chemistry and anatomy. In keeping with the standard Vatican authentication procedure, López Ferreiro confined to a secondary role such nonscientific sources as testimonials and traditional martyrologies. His quarrel was not with modern science, but with modern anthropology, which studied religions comparatively on equal terms and which read classical religious texts as myth rather than legend, that is, as narratives emerging directly from concepts and convictions rather than from real historical events.[55] To take anthropology seriously would be to deny the unimpeachable sacredness of traditional Christian texts.

The first scholarly challenge to *Deus Omnipotens* appeared in 1900 from the French Catholic humanist Louis Duchesne. Director of the *École Française* in Rome, Duchesne argued that the case for the St. James relic rested too

[52] The experience of Lourdes also demonstrates the compatibility of commercial tourism with religious pilgrimage in this period; see Suzanne K. Kaufman, *Consuming Visions: Mass Culture and the Lourdes Shrine* (Ithaca, NY, 2005).

[53] Román López López, *Santiago de Compostela: Guía del peregrino y del turista*, 6th ed. (Santiago de Compostela, 1943), 27.

[54] Román López López, *Santiago de Compostela: Guía del peregrino y del turista*, 1st ed. (Santiago de Compostela, 1915).

[55] For an elucidation of this distinction, see Burleigh, *Earthly Powers*, 218–20.

heavily on apocryphal martyrologies of indeterminate origin.[56] Known among his fellow clergy as a modernist and maverick, Duchesne quickly became a bête noire to the relic's defenders. Within a year of Duchesne's refutation, López Ferreiro countered, launching the bimonthly *Galicia Histórica* to provide a "compilation of historical sources . . . founded on the indestructible pedestal of true history rather than the inconsistencies of legend."[57] The St. James question, unsurprisingly, featured more prominently than any other topic for the duration of the review's thirty-month run. It published frequent attacks on Duchesne, whose work it called "hypercritical, aprioristic, and subjective" and whom it labeled a "positivist, because he ignores the eternal principles of metaphysics."[58] For his part, Fita further supported the authenticity thesis in the pages of the Jesuit review *Razón y Fé*.[59] Like López Ferreiro, Fita argued that the ancient world had left insufficient hard evidence to permit scientists to rely on archaeology alone but that positivists were too close-minded to accept the value of theological sources. Attacks on Duchesne, like attacks on positivism and liberalism generally, were thinly veiled expressions of anti-French sentiment, perhaps the most widely shared source of modern Spanish nationalism.

Despite López Ferreiro's and Fita's best efforts, most scholars, Spanish and otherwise, came to adopt the skeptical position. By the 1930s, influential Spanish medievalists had moved on to questions surrounding the ancient origins of the cult of St. James, a crucial but separate matter from the authenticity of the relic.[60] Franco, himself Galician, indulged a quixotic commitment to the authenticity thesis for some time once in power. His regime funded further excavations at Santiago de Compostela in the 1940s and 1950s, producing no significant new findings. Partisans of the relic eased off on claims to offer proof, demurring only that the shrine's authenticity remained an "open question" subject to ongoing debate.[61] As long as that question remained open, it was hoped that the relic would remain an auxiliary to the moral reconquest of Spain from modern skepticism.

Academic debate notwithstanding, the popular cult thrived and grew, receiving ever more attention in the national press with each passing year and

[56] Louis Duchesne, "Saint-Jacques à Galice," *Annales du Midi* 12 (1900): 145–79. Also see Márquez Villanueva, *Santiago*, 42–44.

[57] *Galicia Histórica* 1 (1901): 6.

[58] Ibid., 7.

[59] Fidel Fita, "Santiago de Galicia: Nuevas impugnaciones y nuevas defensas," *Razón y Fé* 1 (1901): 70–73.

[60] See, e.g., Ramón Menéndez-Pidal, *Historia de España*, 34 vols. (Madrid, 1935–58), 6:51–57; Claudio Sánchez Albornoz, *Spain: A Historical Enigma*, 2 vols. (1956; repr., Madrid, 1975), 1:266–285.

[61] José Guerra Campos, *La cuestión jacobea en el siglo XX* (Santiago de Compostela, 2004), 66.

proving a useful means to display the emerging force of National Catholicism. This process attained new heights during the Civil War (1936–39). The Spanish church supported the actions of Francisco Franco's insurgent army, which it cast as a crusade to restore its status and privilege. For their part, Franco's *Nacionales* were pleased to identify their campaign with Spanish Catholicism. Nationalist soldiers and militants from Franco's political arm, the Falange, made a strong presence at numerous religious festivals. Throughout Nationalist-controlled territory, including at Santiago de Compostela, they collaborated with municipal and church officials in organizing and choreographing such events. Franco used the 1937 Holy Year as the occasion to reestablish the royal offering to St. James, which had been canceled most recently in 1931 by the Republic that many Catholics considered radically anticlerical. As noted above, Pope Pius XI graced 1938 with exceptional Holy Year status to cement the bond between St. James and the Francoist cause. Nationalist propagandists exploited this to the fullest extent possible. Buses shuttled tourists to shrines along the pilgrimage route as docents narrated stories of divinely inspired nationalist victories.[62] In the context of World War II, the Francoist crusade was ripe to be internationalized. During the 1943 Holy Year celebration, the fascist aesthete Ernesto Giménez Caballero wrote that "Compostela was and will continue to be the greatest European and Catholic symbol against the Orient . . . like a latter-day Almanzor, Stalin could send his armies to the gates of Compostela so that his beasts could drink the blessed waters of the Apostle."[63] This "politicization of the sacred" resembled a variant of the "sacralized politics" of the European fascist leaders, though with the crucial difference that the church always remained sufficiently independent and pluralist to harbor critics of National Catholic practice.[64] In 1939, for example, some prominent church officials, including the liberal Tarragonese Archbishop Francesc Vidal i Barraquer and Seville's ultraconservative Cardinal Segura, complained to little effect that such exhibitions were overly political and lacked religious depth.[65]

The Holy Year of 1948 marked the apotheosis of the *reconquista* paradigm. The daily *Voz de Galicia* would describe the year's festivities as a "harmonic

[62] Sandie Holguín, "'National Spain Invites You': Battlefield Tourism during the Spanish Civil War," *American Historical Review* 110 (2005): 1399–1426.

[63] *Pueblo Gallego*, July 26, 1943.

[64] See Giuliana Di Febo, *Ritos de guerra y de victoria en la España franquista* (Bilbao, 2002); and Emilio Luis Lara López, "Nacionalcatolicismo y religiosidad popular (1939–1953): Un análisis de documentación fotográfica," Historia, antropología, y fuentes orales 29 (2003): 71–83.

[65] Frances Lannon, *Privilege, Persecution, and Prophecy: The Catholic Church in Spain, 1875–1975* (Oxford, 1987), 33; Ramon Muntanyola, *Vidal i Barraquer, el cardenal de la paz* (Barcelona, 1971), 422.

synthesis of the military and the religious."[66] The 1948 pilgrimage was indeed a patchwork representing the different major mass ideological constituencies of early Francoism. Franco did not appear but sent his education minister, José Ibáñez Martín, while the Vatican sent a cardinal legate.[67] The event mobilized national organizations such as the lay Catholic Action Youth (JAC) and the official university syndicate (SEU), along with scores of diocesan groups, mostly from Galicia and neighboring provinces, and societies such as the National Organization for the Blind and the Press Association. The cathedral canon estimated that half a million pilgrims venerated the shrine in 1948, half of them arriving in groups of over one hundred.[68] In addition to nearly daily arrivals of mass pilgrimages on buses and on foot, he reported a "continual influx, at all hours, of families, professional groups, and unaffiliated pilgrims," adding: "Nobody remembers such an intensity of visitors as we have had this year. A walk around the neighborhood of the Cathedral is an occasion to cross and mingle with new faces and with cars bearing license plates from every country (in this period the Portuguese are particularly abundant), and repeatedly to answer the query, 'Excuse me, where is the Holy Gate?'"[69] Although organizers had arranged for extra trains, chartered buses, and even an air taxi service from Madrid and Zaragoza, the archdiocese reported with thinly disguised glee that the transport infrastructure was insufficient to accommodate the numbers.

The JAC sponsored the largest single group pilgrimage of 1948. The idea to do this had first been advanced at the organization's convention of 1932, but war had prevented its fruition for the Holy Years of 1937 and 1943. On August 28, 1948, perhaps 68,000 young men converged on Santiago de Compostela, arriving mainly by chartered bus. They were joined the following day by approximately 2,500 members of the women's auxiliary. Another 30,000–40,000 from the Portuguese Catholic Action arrived.[70] The JAC organizers sought not only to attract massive numbers but also to inject the event with greater religious solemnity. Leading the pilgrimage was the seminarian Manuel Aparici Navarro, a longtime JAC activist known for his commitment to prayer and penitence and his contempt for political engage-

[66] *La Voz de Galicia*, June 12, 1948.

[67] *Compostela: Boletín informativo del año santo de 1948* 11 (August–September 1948).

[68] *Compostela: Boletín informativo del año santo de 1948* 12 (November–December 1948).

[69] ACSC, Fondo Guerra Campos, Sin. C. 27/2.

[70] *Compostela: Boletín informativo del año santo de 1948* 11 (August–September 1948).

ment.[71] For its part, the archdiocese issued a catechism warning pilgrims against signing profane songs, even during the journey.

Other groups, however, retained a more military-nationalist approach to the 1948 Holy Year. Writing to request a state subvention to carry out a group pilgrimage, the national director of the SEU emphasized "the transcendental political significance of this march, given that all the Institutions more or less tied to youth are attempting to stage a pilgrimage to Santiago, and it would be unfortunate if the SEU remained sidelined from this common desire to highlight the Holy Year."[72] Though not the largest, the SEU march would be the most theatrical. About one hundred Spanish youth—clad in Falangist blue rather than the traditional pilgrim's outfit—would walk the medieval route from Roncesvalles over thirty-three days carrying tents and supplies on their backs. In addition, 288 members of the Spanish army's mounted cavalry undertook a twenty-day march to Santiago de Compostela, stopping en route at Clavijo, site of the supposed ninth-century battle where St. James debuted as Moorslayer. For his part, the director of the Spanish National Sport Syndicate, another Falangist outfit, reportedly "did not know about the pilgrimage, but was interested. It is something very athletic, very Spanish, and St. James is very fascist [*facho*]."[73]

Overall, the 1948 celebration was a catharsis for National Catholic militancy on a scale that had been impossible during the Civil War and its difficult aftermath. The JAC would never organize such an event again; the so-called Generation of '48 grew older and its successors abandoned the notion of moral reconquest. Similarly, the major Catholic review *El Debate*, a premier voice of National Catholicism and, more specifically, of the pilgrimage, lost much of its raison d'être after 1948.[74] But if the 1948 pilgrimage turned out to be the swan song of neo-Catholic militancy, one might have also observed a growing interest in the pilgrimage route and journey. The Falangist groups, though ideologically obsolescent, were prescient in their emphasis on unity through physical exertion and sacrifice. This, the central experience of the medieval pilgrim, had begun to supplant the question of the relic's authenticity as the dominant moral theme of the pilgrimage.

[71] Segundo L. Pérez López, *Religiosidad popular y peregrinación jacobea: Caminar con Santiago y Santa María* (Santiago de Compostela, 2004), 123–25, and *Manuel Aparici Navarro: "Capitán de Peregrinos" (1902–1964) y el ideal peregrinante* ([Madrid?], 2000), 28.

[72] José Díaz del Moral to Tesoro General del Movimieno, February 18, 1948, Archivo General de la Administración, Alcalá de Henares (hereafter AGA), 9: 17.05.04/8668.

[73] ACSC, Fondo Guerra Campos, C-5/1–2.

[74] *Manuel Aparici Navarro*, 28; Pablo Martín de Santa Olalla, *De la victoria al Concordato: Las relaciones iglesia-estado durante el "primer franquismo" (1939–1953)* (Barcelona, 2003), 147–49, 175.

The Pilgrimage: Missionary Authenticity

For the first seven decades following its alleged discovery, the St. James relic exhibited a nineteenth-century pattern, fueling a popular cult while provoking a largely separate academic debate over its authenticity. On this process, we now superimpose a second, slower to form, in which erudite interest in the medieval pilgrimage route widened into a popular fascination with its practice and preservation. Here the status of the relic was unimportant, and concern for the authenticity of the pilgrimage itself was paramount.

This second process originated in the mid-nineteenth-century Gothic Revival but survived long after the twilight of Romantic culture. Santiago de Compostela had become a destination for Romantic travelers after receiving a glowing endorsement for its medieval architecture in the 1845 edition of Richard Ford's *A Hand-book for Travellers in Spain and Readers at Home*. In 1866, London's South Kensington Museum (today the Victoria and Albert Museum) displayed a full-scale replica of the *Pórtico de la Gloria*, the cathedral's main gate, which exemplified the twelfth-century Iberian Romanesque.[75] The rediscovery of such splendid art in such a remote location as Galicia generated scholarly interest in understanding the transmission lines—notably the pilgramage—between medieval Europe's main cultural centers and Santiago de Compostela. When searching the cathedral archives in 1879, presumably with the guidance of López Ferreiro, Fidel Fita came across a twelfth-century edition of the *Codex Calixtinus*, a kind of pilgrim's guide documenting miracles and shrines and providing practical information for travelers of the itinerary across northern Iberia. This arduous journey began from one of four points in France and crossed the Pyrenees at Roncesvalles or Somport, whence pilgrims took roughly one month to traverse Navarre, Burgos, León, and Galicia to reach Santiago de Compostela. The authentic Camino de Santiago—the itinerary described in the *Codex*—attracted the interest of art historians and preservationists. Fita worked with a Parisian press to put out the first modern edition of the *Codex*, which appeared in 1882 in the original Latin. The edition was not widely available, however, and subsequent projects to produce French, German, and English editions were never completed. A Spanish version at last appeared in 1929, followed in 1938 by a French edition that would become the scholarly standard.[76]

The first academic studies of the pilgrimage were in fact carried out by art historians. These works served as guides for cultural tourists, but their more

[75] Matilde Mateos Sevilla, *El Pórtico de la Gloria en la Inglaterra victoriana: La invención de una obra maestra* (Santiago de Compostela, 1991), 35–36.

[76] A brief history of the publications of the *Codex* is given in the introduction to Jeanne Viellard, *Le guide du pèlerin de Saint-Jacques de Compostelle* (Paris, 1938). Also see William Melczer, *The Pilgrim's Guide to Santiago de Compostela* (New York, 1993), 134.

significant effect was to help frame the debate over Spain's historical identity in the terms that it would assume throughout the twentieth century: whether the Spanish nation was the product of medieval European expansion or of the syncretism of a civilizational borderland. In the 1880s, López Ferreiro produced an eleven-volume history that can be considered the official church position on the late medieval artistic flowering in Santiago de Compostela and along the pilgrimage route. This work interpreted Romanesque iconography as a didactic assertion of Trinitarian dogma—which Muslim rulers in this religious borderland had often condemned as pantheistic—radiating from a dynamic, crusading Europe whose throngs of pilgrims had reanimated northern Iberia. The Harvard medievalist Arthur Kingsley Porter endorsed this interpretation in a later study. A contrary thesis was proposed by Émile Mâle, a pioneering French scholar of medieval religious art. Mâle argued that the Spanish Romanesque revealed a strong Islamic influence, indicating that pilgrimage was a transmission belt of Islamic culture into Europe.[77]

The essence of this debate would become the central problem in twentieth-century Spanish identity, but for promoters of tourism this tension posed not a dilemma but a scintillating attraction. From the first days of tourist promotion, campaigns to attract foreigners emitted the paradoxical claims that Spain was a fully "European" travel destination and that, nevertheless, in the words of a slogan first appearing in the 1920s, "Spain is different."[78] The godfather of Spanish tourism, the Marquis de la Vega Inclán, evoked the classic Spanish enigma without taking sides. In a 1927 speech to the Royal Academy of History, Vega Inclán referred to the Camino de Santiago as "the old road that Europeanized Spain, and, if you'll permit me to say so, that Hispanicized Western Europe."[79]

Yet despite the emerging awareness of its role in Spanish and European history, the pilgrimage route continued to languish in a state of decay. The major cathedrals along the route all attained the protection of monument preservation laws before the close of the nineteenth century, but efforts to protect other major architectural jewels along the route were stifled.[80] A

[77] Arthur Kingsley Porter, *The Romanesque Sculpture of the Pilgrimage Roads*, 10 vols. (New York, 1923); Émile Mâle, *Religious Art in France: The Twelfth Century; A Study of the Origins of Medieval Iconography* (1922; repr., Princeton, NJ, 1978). On the debate, see Márquez Villanueva, *Santiago*, 118–21, and Pérez López, *Religiosidad popular*, 29.

[78] Sasha D. Pack, "Tourism, Modernisation and Difference: A Twentieth-Century Spanish Paradigm," *Sport in Society* 11 (2008): 657–72.

[79] Benigno Vega-Inclán y Flaquer, *Guía del viaje a Santiago (Libro V del Códice Calixtino), discurso leido en la Real Academia de la Historia, 19 junio 1927, por el M. de la Vega-Inclán, y contestación de Don Julio Puyol y Alonso* (Madrid, 1927), 25.

[80] The cathedrals attained protected status in the following order: León, 1844; Burgos, 1885; Santiago de Compostela, 1896. See Aurora Rivière Gómez, "Arqueól-

local preservationist group in León attempted to gain recognition for the impressive plateresque St. Mark's Monastery, but the Spanish army opposed the plan, hoping to convert it to a barracks.[81] The municipality of Santiago de Compostela attempted to gain more general protection for the entire medieval quarter, but attained this special status only for the Plaza de Alfonso XII in 1916. As for the remainder of the old town, the national monuments commission judged that town conservators were operating "without enough preparation and without the discipline of a rigorous plan."[82] Only in 1940, during the germinal revolutionary moment of the Franco regime, did Santiago de Compostela, along with Toledo, receive privileged status as a historical-artistic monument, preserving the entire town center and granting it priority status in the distribution of funds from the National Artistic Patrimony.[83] In 1962, the entire route described in the *Codex Calixtinus* was designated a "national patronate" as part of a wider promotional effort.

The Franco regime's interest in Santiago de Compostela changed as dramatically as the political conditions in which it operated. The National Catholic stagings of the 1930s and 1940s began to recede in favor of a deeper engagement with the pilgrimage and its history. One of the regime's preeminent cultural institutions, the Institute of Spain, was the first to signal the shift. In 1942, anticipating the 1,900th anniversary of the martyrdom, the Institute sponsored a national contest to publish a book-length study on the theme "The pilgrimage of St. James." The call generated two noteworthy submissions, both massive works in excess of one thousand pages. Luciano Huidobro's *Las peregrinaciones jacobeas* won the contest's 50,000-peseta prize; the runner-up, *Las peregrinaciones a Santiago de Compostela*, a collaborative effort directed by Luis Vázquez de Parga, was chosen the same year for the more prestigious Francisco Franco Prize. In addition to their extraordinary literary and scholarly merit, each of the works dovetailed with contemporary political expedients. Contest judges found in Huidobro's tome

ogos y arqueología en el proceso de construcción del estado-nación español (1834–1868)," in *La cristalización del pasado: Génesis y desarrollo del marco institucional de la arqueología en España*, ed. Gloria Mora and Margarita Díaz-Andreu (Málaga, 1997), 133–39.

[81] Files on monument preservation in nineteenth-century Spain are housed at the Real Academia de Historia (hereafter RAH), Madrid. On León, see RAH CAC/9/7959/10(1–43). On Santiago de Compostela, see RAH CAC/9/7953/26 and CAC/9/7953/23(2). Also see José Luis Meilán Gil, ed., *Estudios jurídicos sobre el Camino de Santiago* (Santiago de Compostela, 1993), 13.

[82] "Informe sobre la obra de Celestino Sánchez Rivera, Conservador de los Monumentos Nacionales de Santiago," October 5, 1928, RAH CAC/9/7953/26.

[83] "Decreto declarando Monumentos Históricos-Artísticos las ciudades de Santiago y Toledo," AGA 8: 17.02/19172.

an "urge to discover the historic past which characterizes our society, and a return to the glorious traditions that inform the political movement of today's Spain."[84]

Both works studiously eschewed the question of the relic's authenticity, focusing instead on the pilgrimage as a dynamic nexus of travel, internationalism, and exchange. The Vázquez de Parga study, the more scholarly of the two, became the seminal historical study of the pilgrimage, examining its political, social, and religiocultural dimensions in the wider context of medieval Europe. The study chronicled Santiago de Compostela's rise in the eleventh century to an international prestige rivaling that of Rome and depicted the Iberian Peninsula as the vigorous frontier of a unified and crusading Europe. Long dependent on trade with the Islamic peninsular dominions, Christian Spain, wrote the contributor José María Lacarra, "would now look toward Europe. The pilgrimage route would at the same time become the great trade route of northern Spain." The advent of the pilgrimage stimulated commerce, repopulated the northern Iberian corridor, and propelled a southward thrust of European society and culture. The Camino de Santiago, Lacarra concluded, was "a collective phenomenon of medieval Christian Europe."[85] Hampered by Franco's associations with fascism and enduring perceptions of Spain's "oriental" character, many in the Spanish government regarded any evidence of their country's cultural and religious contributions to European civilization as a just rebuttal. The Europeanist angle of the Vázquez de Parga study in this sense resembled a cultural outgrowth of the Franco regime's emerging attitude toward postwar Europe as a "family of nations" unified by a common Christian inheritance.[86]

Emphasis on the pilgrimage route and its place in medieval European history opened the way for a different kind of tourism, associated as much with national image as with religious devotion. Huidobro's prize-winning book argued that the "Pilgrim-Tourist" was "not incompatible with devotion to Santiago," and that his activities "came to constitute . . . a special type that

[84] Gonzalo Martínez Díez, "Introducción y bibliografía del autor," preface to Luciano Huidobro, *Las peregrinaciones jacobeas*, 2 vols. (1950; repr., Burgos, 1999), 1:1, 3, 11–14.

[85] Luis Vázquez de Parga, José María Lacarra, and Juan Uría Ríu, *Las peregrinaciones a Santiago de Compostela*, 3 vols. (Madrid, 1948), 1:465–66.

[86] On post-1945 Spanish attitudes toward European unity, see Petra María Weber, "El CEDI: Promotor del Occidente cristiano y de las relaciones hispano-alemanas de los años cincuenta," *Hispania* 54 (1994): 1077–1103; Miguel ángel Ruiz Carnicer, "La idea de Europa en la cultura franquista, 1939–1962," *Hispania* 58 (1998): 679–701; Antonio Moreno Juste, "La unidad europea en la bibliografía española de 1945–1962," *Hispania* 50 (1990): 1453–1473; Pedro Carlos González Cuevas, "Neoconservadurismo e identidad europea (una aproximación histórica)," *Spagna contemporanea* 13 (1998): 41–60.

did our Fatherland the great service that tourism offers: that of propaganda for Spain's beauty and grandeur."[87] This hope captured the broad justification for state involvement in the hospitality sector and for the regime's decision to elevate tourism to a cabinet-level portfolio in 1951.[88] Tourism was widely understood to be a significant factor in the construction of postwar Europe as an aspect of bilateral trade, a pole of economic development, and a tool to dismantle physical and cultural barriers. The Catholic Church, like a number of transnational and intergovernmental institutions, by then had also embraced the generic concept of tourism as a social and spiritual good. Pius XII wrote in 1952 that tourism "refines the senses, enlarges the spirit and enriches the experience," turning "the strange, or even the irritating or ridiculous" into customs merely "different, often understandable, and even prudent."[89]

The feast of St. James, as we have seen, had already blurred the distinction between pilgrim and tourist, but hitherto it had attracted primarily a religious or National Catholic kind of tourism rather than one of cultural exchange or heritage. Some argued that religious tourism betrayed the authentic spirit of the pilgrimage, which should place atonement ahead of leisure. In 1937, a Franciscan review had contrasted those "who made their pilgrimage with the unction of sincere, old-fashioned Christians: 25, 40, 70, 100 kilometers on foot, some barefoot, with only bread and water," with "the pilgrims—as we will call them out of habit—who have made their journey in high comfort, as tourists."[90] An American traveler to Santiago de Compostela during the 1930s reported having seen only one bona fide pilgrim, a man bedecked with the customary pilgrim's garments, staff, and scallop shell, claiming to have walked from Valladolid. Noting that "modern pilgrimages to Santiago were crowded excursions in trains and buses," the American suspected that the appearance of this purported pilgrim had been "staged by the students" hoping to prompt tourists to open their pocketbooks.[91] There were undoubtedly some examples of *homo viator*—the pilgrim who derived spiritual nourishment from the hardships of the journey itself—but this ideal scarcely registered in the Jacobean discourse of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. Although the archdiocese hoped for greater religious depth in 1948, the logistics of most processions was little changed. Apart from one hundred

[87] Huidobro, *Las peregrinaciones jacobeas*, 1:340.

[88] See Pack, *Tourism and Dictatorship*, 39–82.

[89] Quoted in José Ignacio de Arrillaga, *Ensayos sobre turismo* (Madrid, 1962), 119; also see Michael Cronin, "Next to Being There: Ireland of the Welcomes and Tourism of the Word," in *Irish Tourism: Image, Culture, and Identity*, ed. Michael Cronin and Barbara O'Connor (Clevedon, 2003), 180.

[90] *El eco franciscano* 54 (1937): 364.

[91] Ruth Matilda Anderson, *The Gallegan Provinces of Spain: Pontevedra and La Coruña* (New York, 1939), 170–71.

blue-shirted trekkers, the vast majority arrived on mechanized transport. The archdiocese bulletin could point to no greater suffering than pilgrims in "uncomfortable trucks" and "tightly crammed in trains and boats."[92]

After the massive public pilgrimages of 1948, the custodians of Santiago de Compostela began to reorient their ecclesiastical and political message to reflect the rising acceptance of travel itself as a spiritual good. This was largely the labor of cathedral canon José Guerra Campos, who inherited the leadership of the Archconfraternity of St. James in 1951. Guerra Campos worked to emphasize the transcendental and historical value of the pilgrimage journey and to limit references to the relic itself. When the local committee began preparations for the 1954 Holy Year, Guerra Campos urged the "large-scale diffusion of brief, agile pamphlets that convey the spirituality (not the archaeology) of Santiago [and] that show the Holy Apostle of the Gospel (and not only the patriot of Clavijo)," and the introduction of "propaganda about *pilgrimages*."[93] In 1953, the church at Roncesvalles began keeping a registry of pilgrims who set out for Santiago de Compostela from this distant Pyrenean outpost (though the original was lost and a new one begun only in 1970).[94] To coincide with the Holy Year of 1954, a major Catholic press published a pilgrim's memoir by Javier Martín Artajo, a Mardileño youth who walked to Santiago de Compostela in 1928 with his brother Alberto (who would later ascend the ranks of the JAC leadership and serve as Franco's foreign minister from 1945 to 1957). Martín Artajo's narrative portrays two young men possessed of intense religious devotion, patriotism, and mettle. It recounts a religious trek that led to indescribable ecstasy on hugging the shrine after twenty days of walking, but the pilgrimage was also a *Bildungsreise*. The journey taught the well-heeled youth the humility of asking for succor on parish church floors and transformed them into true pilgrims from the moment when the path began to supersede the destination. The book's preface, written by the family priest, quoted the popular doggerel "Oh, the noble pilgrim, who stops to meditate, at the end of the long road, on the horror of arriving."[95]

Catholic interest in emphasizing the act of pilgrimage dovetailed with the Franco regime's emerging attitude toward tourism. Although coastal beaches drew the lion's share of private and state investment, a number of government planners envisaged a more prominent role for the Camino de Santiago. Franco, though he appreciated only belatedly the overall importance of tour-

[92] *Compostela: Boletín informativo del año santo de 1948* 12 (August–September 1948).

[93] ACSC, Fondo Guerra Campos, C-5/1.

[94] Ellen Okner Feinberg, "Strangers and Pilgrims on the Camino de Santiago in Spain: The Perpetuation and Recreation of Meaningful Performance" (PhD diss., Princeton University, 1985), 28.

[95] Javier Martín Artajo, *Caminando a Compostela* (Madrid, 1954), 10, 90.

ism in the stability of his regime, became personally involved in making the Camino de Santiago into a major international attraction. The dictator's direct intervention appears in fact to have prevented a fatal mixture of short-term interests and incompetent management from undermining the process. In 1952, Franco "poured cold water" on a locally hatched proposal to build a kind of pilgrims' campus with new roads and hotels surrounding the cathedral. He was skeptical that a local, privately financed project would live up to any standard of quality—candidly remarking in a private meeting with Guerra Campos that Spain's construction industry had mastered "the national vice of lying." Instead, the caudillo harbored a "mania" for converting the fifteenth-century Royal Hospital, adjacent to the cathedral, into a luxury hotel that would preserve the original architecture. Franco visited Santiago de Compostela to meet with the local festival committee in September 1952 and, following a midday pause to venerate the St. James shrine, reportedly announced to his hosts that he would tell his personnel in Madrid to treat this as an urgent matter. Franco's interest provoked an avalanche of unsolicited attention from other government officials, yielding generous budgets for advertising and public works. As private speculators began to devour coastal land and attract lowbrow European beachgoers, ambitious bureaucrats hoped that the Royal Hospital project could present to skeptics in Franco's cabinet an aspect of the Spanish tourism sector more worthy of state support. As a result, the state holding company (Instituto Nacional de la Industria, or INI) received permission to convert the Royal Hospital into the five-star Hostal de los Reyes Católicos in time for the 1954 Holy Year. This achievement paved the way for the incorporation in 1963 of a new state enterprise, the National Tourism Company (ENTURSA), in order to fund politically useful tourism projects that failed to attract private investors (such as luxury hotels in diplomatically sensitive territories of the Campo de Gibraltar and Morocco).[96] As Guerra Campos would observe, "it really looks as though the Caudillo has set everybody in motion."[97]

The absorption of the Camino de Santiago into the national tourism promotional apparatus accelerated in the 1960s. For the first time, a group located somewhere other than Santiago de Compostela or Madrid asserted a stake in the pilgrimage. An association of local merchants and municipal leaders called Los Amigos del Camino de Santiago formed in Estella, a town lying along the original route that was first settled by French migrants in the eleventh century. In 1961, the group sponsored an essay contest on the theme "Pan-Europeanism and the Road of St. James," the announcement of which in the pages of Spain's leading national daily mastered the political orthodoxy of the Franco regime at mid passage: "The

[96] Pack, *Tourism and Dictatorship*, 116.
[97] ACSC, Fondo Guerra Campos, C/5/1.

transcendental cultural and religious importance of the pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela during the Middle Ages was of such high caliber that it is no exaggeration to claim that, thanks to it, Spain was united to European or Christian civilization, for it provided a counterweight to the influence of Islam that dominated almost the entire peninsula."[98]

In September 1962, the government declared the entire route a national patronate under the auspices of the Directorate-General of Fine Arts. This was one of the first cultural acts of a new cabinet that would prove far more involved in tourism promotion than its predecessor. The goal was to advance the route's "reconstitution, conservation, and protection" in advance of the 1965 Holy Year and, more generally, "to change the face touristic Spain presents to the world."[99] The private diaries of José Guerra Campos indicate that pressure from groups like that of Estella, along with interest from the INI and a few Spanish diplomats, prompted the government to act so broadly. The patronate provided a formal mechanism for leaders of the Santiago archdiocese to collaborate with various branches of the Spanish government. The regime's undersecretary of tourism, Antonio J. García Rodríguez-Acosta, conveyed martial resolve, circulating the details of "Operación Camino de Santiago" to the ministries of public works, housing, finance, and foreign affairs. Each administrative entity was called upon to play a part, such as issuing loans for hotel improvements, restoring the old network of pilgrims' hostels along the route (a project that achieved only very limited results), improving highways and service stations to accommodate automotive pilgrim-tourists, and working with consulates and tourism offices abroad to publicize the pilgrimage. The Spanish delegation in Paris assembled a large exhibit on the Camino de Santiago at a major French tourism exposition in 1964, while the veteran diplomat José Miguel Ruiz Morales authored promotional materials aimed at international audiences.[100] After nearly a century of false starts, the dictatorship achieved the conversion of St. Mark's Monastery in León, just past the route's midpoint, into a luxury hotel under the aegis of ENTURSA. Noting that much of the route's scenery was unremarkable, Rodríguez-Acosta sought to create "a mise-en-scène that in some way dramatizes the Camino" by bringing into view historic structures hitherto obscured by billboards and overgrown vegetation.[101] The route was marked with explanatory signage and studded with the traditional iconography

[98] *ABC* (Madrid), April 18, 1961.

[99] "Decreto 2224/1962, de 5 de septiembre, por el que se declara conjunto histórico-artístico el llamado Camino de Santiago y se crea su Patronato," *Boletín oficial del estado*, September 7, 1962; "Ruta de Santiago: Estudio turístico preliminar," 1962, AGA 3: 49.05/22599.

[100] ACSC, Fondo Guerra Campos, C/5/1–3.

[101] "Operación Camino de Santiago," AGA 3: 49.08/35208. For an unkind descrip-

of conch shells and St. James crosses. To recognize pilgrims of the authentic type, the church began in 1965 to issue a special certificate to those who trekked more than 300 kilometers on foot. This certificate entitled pilgrims to three days' free lodging and meals in Santiago de Compostela, though some recipients complained that church authorities in fact treated them with little regard.[102]

The propaganda benefits of restoring the Camino de Santiago far exceeded the economic benefits. Neither of the Empresa Nacional de Turismo, S.A. (ENTURSA) ventures was an instant commercial success, averaging roughly 20 percent occupancy throughout the 1960s (though they would become profitable the following decade).[103] Tourism revenue in provinces along the route did not increase markedly either, as the vast majority of pilgrims were true to the humble ethic of their medieval forebears. An undercover envoy of the Ministry of Information and Tourism reported in July 1965 that 5,000 pilgrims reached the city each day, but most "[brought] their own snacks and lunches, including drinks," then "abandoned the city at mid-afternoon."[104] If the expectation was unrealistic that an old pilgrimage route would pay great economic dividends, the regime nevertheless had ample reason to identify its efforts in tourism promotion with the pilgrimage. For the conservative regime increasingly addicted to revenue from beach resorts, the success of the pilgrimage indicated that attracting international tourism did not necessarily require importing hedonism and moral decadence. The Camino de Santiago would help, in the words of a tourism ministry study, "to change the face touristic Spain presents to the world."[105] Moreover, it evoked European unity—"a political factor," as Rodríguez-Acosta explained to Carrero Blanco, "which in these times should not be sold short."[106] This ecumenical message resembled the dictates of the Second Vatican Council (1962–65), which the highest levels of the Spanish government and church had received with skepticism or outright contempt. Archbishop Fernando Quiroga Palacios of Santiago de Compostela, a tepid adherent to the reformist council, characterized the 1965 Holy Year pilgrimage as "a message of spirituality within the wave of tourist

tion of the state of the pilgrimage route in the early 1960s, see Paul Guinard, *L'Espagne* (Paris, 1963), 98.

[102] Ellen O. Feinberg, *Following the Milky Way: A Pilgrimage across Spain* (Ames, IA, 1989), 281–82.

[103] ENTURSA, "Memoria, ejercicio, Oct., 1971" AGA 3: 49.22/46567; Pack, *Tourism and Dictatorship*, 155.

[104] Salvador Pons to Manuel Fraga, July 16, 1965, AGA 3: 49.08/35210.

[105] "Ruta de Santiago: Estudio turístico preliminar," 1962, AGA 3: 49.05/22599. On the establishment of the National Tourism Company (ENTURSA), see Pack, *Tourism and Dictatorship*, 116–17.

[106] Rodríguez-Acosta to Carrero Blanco, March 8, 1963, AGA 3: 49.08/35199.

activity that Spain has been experiencing." He declared it the "Holy Year of Unity," though, unlike government publicists, he defiantly insisted on the relic's authenticity and quoted at length from Leo XIII's 1884 bull.[107] One might dismiss such messages as outward-bound propaganda orchestrated by a regime fundamentally hostile to democratic Europe and to reformist Catholicism. Be that as it may, the messages pioneered here far outlived the regime and the elder generation of clerics that supported it.

The extent of international press coverage of the 1965 Holy Year did not disappoint. In addition to significant French, German, Portuguese, American, and British attention, the Camino de Santiago was featured in travel sections of the *Revista Hispano-Americana*, Brazil's major Spanish-language review, and the Buenos Aires daily *La Nación*. Coverage was nearly all positive, save a reference to Galicia's poverty in the *New York Times*, whose correspondent observed: "The Galicia countryside does not seem to have profited much from the ancient or the modern pilgrimages."[108] The pilgrimage made its television debut the same year. In January, images of Franco ceremonially opening the Santiago cathedral gate to mark the start of the Holy Year were broadcast in Spain, Portugal, the Netherlands, France, and Belgium.[109]

The itinerary was becoming a particular vogue among French tourists. The Société des Amis de Saint Jacques de Compostelle, founded in 1950, organized several pilgrimage tours. French pilgrim-tourists undertook some or all of the pilgrimage on foot, horseback, or bicycle. Most did only small sections of the route, but a contingent of some sixty pilgrims on horseback departed Paris for Santiago de Compostela in 1965, and another fourteen, organized by the national touring clubs of France and Belgium, set out from Bordeaux.[110] Rising French interest in the pilgrimage spawned a plethora of local studies on medieval pilgrimage routes, though authentic itineraries north of the Pyrenees were more difficult to identify. The Camino de Santiago was as much a part of French history as of Spanish, having been assiduously promoted by Cluny monks for centuries, but modern French scholarship never produced a basic work on the history of pilgrimage akin to the contribution of Vázquez de Parga. The uncertainty prompted the Société's director to complain that town tourism boards were muddling the accurate picture and exaggerating their claims to being historic pilgrimage hubs.[111] The questions of how to establish the authentic

[107] Fernando Quiroga Palacios, November 1964, full text at AGA 9: 10.01/8742.

[108] Tad Szulc, "Santiago de Compostela Receives Thousands of European Pilgrims," *New York Times*, September 17, 1965. A large store of related press clippings is found at AGA 8: 10.01/8742.

[109] *Universe* (London), January 22, 1965.

[110] *Sud-Ouest* (Bordeaux), March 29, 1965; *Herald Tribune* (Paris), June 10, 1965.

[111] René de La Coste-Messelière, "Importance réelle des routes dites de Saint-

route and what kind of variations were acceptable for the benefit of tourism and commerce became the subject of controversy and debate. After much arbitration and compromise, certain alternate routes were posted so that cyclists, pedestrians, equestrians, and motorists could select the route best suited for their mode of conveyance.[112]

IV. The Pilgrimage in Democratic Spain and the Legacy of National Catholicism

Spain's transition from dictatorship to democracy in the 1970s did not dramatically change the pilgrimage. Numbers of pilgrims and tourists continued to rise steadily, as they had since 1879, and the distinction between the two categories remained imprecise. Estimates of total visitors were measured in hundreds of thousands in 1954, 1963, and 1971 and in millions by 1982; pilgrims covering the entire route on foot went from the hundreds to the tens of thousands. Brotherhoods of St. James proliferated throughout Europe in the 1980s and the Holy Years of 1982 and 1993 occasioned ever larger waves of publishing on the topic.[113] The creation of a Galician regional government in 1981 added a new level of jurisdiction with special enthusiasm for promoting the pilgrimage. As a result, a Galician regionalist element, toned down but never fully abandoned during the Franco period, gained a larger profile in the Jacobean celebrations.

Steady change did not diminish the main principles associated with the pilgrimage as they had developed since midcentury: European unity and Christian ecumenism, common heritage, and the transcendental value of travel. Making the first papal visit ever to Santiago de Compostela in 1982, John Paul II praised pilgrims for the penitential sacrifice their journey represented. At several points in his address, the Pontiff evoked their historical communion with "the faith of past generations" who made the pilgrimage, whereas his references to the relic itself were limited and qualified with references to "tradition" and "memory" rather than its positive identification. The Pope also referred to the "vigorous spiritual and cultural currents of fecund exchange among the European peoples," echoing the emphasis placed by Franco-era scholars on the link between pre-Reformation religious unity and current questions of European integration.[114] The symbolic power of this sacred place was not limited to religion but carried ethnonational

Jacques dans les pays du sud de la France et en Espagne du nord," *Bulletin philologique et historique (jusqu'à 1610)* 1 (1969): 451–70.

[112] ACSC, Fondo Guerra Campos, C/36/13.

[113] See Maryjane Dunn and Linda Kay Davidson, *The Pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela: A Comprehensive, Annotated Bibliography* (New York, 1994).

[114] The Holy See, http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/john_paul_ii/travels/sub_index1982/trav_spagna_en.htm.

significance as well. In 1988, the intergovernmental Council of Europe designated the Camino de Santiago as the "First European Cultural Itinerary." This was the occasion to Europeanize the conch shell emblem that the Franco government had placed on road signs; the new markers would mimic the nascent European flag, bearing a stylized yellow abstraction of a conch shell against a solid blue background. The same year, the Socialist president of Galicia prostrated himself at the cathedral altar—provoking his party's atheist founder Pablo Iglesias and possibly also St. James to turn in their respective graves.[115]

By the end of the twentieth century, Catholics, Galician regionalists, Spanish nationalists, and Europeans claimed St. James as part of their collective patrimony and defined their communities as inheritors of his legacy. This article has documented how partisans of each community marshaled the symbolic power of St. James to assert influence in the others. Possibly as a result of the European Union's secular foundational myths, the nature of religious influence on contemporary European politics and identity has remained shrouded and little understood, even though many of its members until recently harbored powerful National Catholic movements and Christian-Democratic parties were among the EU's chief architects. The religious and cultural tourism centered on Santiago de Compostela was an aspect of Spanish and later of European politics, inasmuch as it was a theater in the struggle to influence the terms in which these political communities were understood. The relic's discovery was closely tied to the rise of Spanish Catholic nationalism, a sentiment the Franco regime would ably exploit during the Spanish Civil War. After World War II, the regime identified the pilgrimage both as an auxiliary for tighter engagement with the nascent European "family of nations" and as a means to mollify its staunch National Catholic constituency as it pursued limited economic and institutional convergence with democratic Europe in other ways. Finally, as ecumenism, exchange, and travel came to the fore, the Council of Europe appropriated the well-trod pilgrimage route as a European heritage.

Yet the striking parallels between the millennial myths of St. James and the language surrounding their revival indicate a deeper relationship between contemporary nationalism and Europeanism, on the one hand, and Europe's religious-cultural past, on the other. The revival set in motion in 1879 was far from being an invention of some tradition out of whole cloth. The obsession with authenticity common to promoters of the relic and the route—the many abuses of their clients' credulity by both groups notwithstanding—awakened a genuine commitment to understanding a significant artifact of European religious and cultural history. Presentist political interests diluted and diverted

[115] Carlos G. Reigosa, "El Camino de Santiago: ¿Hacia una nueva identidad?" in *El Camino de Santiago (cursos de verano de El Escorial, 1993–94)*, ed. Luis Blanco Vila (Madrid, 1995).

the pure interests of historical knowledge, but the parameters of such political uses have nonetheless been circumscribed by the limits of credibility. This artifact of early and medieval Christianity has remained a plausible political symbol across dramatic historical ruptures, from the rise and apogee of hypernationalism to the construction of an allegedly postnational, secular Europe. The current tendency to ascribe to the pilgrimage a millennial spirit of unity and exchange is the consequence of a National Catholic movement's adaptation to a Europeanist age.